Town of Newburgh Historic Preservation Commission September 8, 2022

Members Present:

David Wills, Troy Wells, Heather Cutrell, Jim Renne, Jeff Cox, Tom Goelzhauser, Brent Grafe

Advisory Members Present:

Administrative Present:

Stacie Krieger, Town Council Liaison; Jillian Kratochvil, Legal; Christy Powell, Town Manager

Members & Administrative Absent:

Sue Morrison, Tavi Wydicks, Zoning Administrator

Citizens Present

Michelle Gentry, 320 W. Main Street

Reading, Correction, and Approval of Previous Minutes:

Jeff Cox moved to approve the May minutes. David Wills seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

REPORTS:

Town Council Liaison:

No Report.

Indiana Landmarks Southwest Field Office:

Jim Renne stated that the City of Evansville has hired a full-time historic preservation officer.

Staff Report and Code Enforcement:

No Report.

Newburgh Neighbor Committee:

No Report.

Certified Local Government:

No Report.

Unfinished Business:

Discussion - 221 State Street Garage

Jim Renne stated that the letter to Ms. Richards was sent out with a copy of the covenant.

New Business:

COA Application - 320 W. Main Street

Mrs. Gentry stated that they live in one of the historic districts, but she did not realize their house was historic, and they are wanting to replace their siding because the old section is wood slats that are falling apart and the addition has aluminum siding. Mrs. Gentry stated that they are wanting to use vinyl siding, and when their contract came in for the permit last week to get the permit, they were informed of the historic rating and that vinyl siding replacement would have to be approved by HPC. Mrs. Gentry stated that they cannot afford the upkeep of the damaged wood and aluminum siding, and they would like to replace all siding with vinyl as a cost-effective way to improve the look of the house. Jim Renne clarified with Mrs. Gentry that the existing wood and aluminum would be removed, and she said yes. Stacie Krieger asked what makes the structure historic. The Commission was unable to determine that information. The Commission discussed the structure and the existing siding. Mrs. Gentry stated that she believes the original structure was built in 1960 and the additions were added around 1990. Mr. Renne explained the historic guidelines and stated that vinyl is strictly prohibited in historic

districts. Mr. Renne stated that he appreciates their efforts to improve the structure, but vinyl is not an appropriate material in historic districts. Mr. Renne stated that what is being proposed is removal of historic materials and replacing with not appropriate materials, and that creates an issue for HPC as they are tasked with enforcing the guidelines. Mrs. Gentry stated that she did get a quote for composite siding, but it was an additional \$11,000.00, and they cannot afford that additional cost. The Commission discussed the COA application and the condition of the current siding with the applicant. Mr. Renne proposed applying for the Newburgh Neighbor Grant Program, and Mrs. Gentry stated that Tavi Wydicks provided her with grant information and application. Mr. Renne stated that the issue the Commission faces is that if vinyl siding is allowed in this case, it creates an issue with other applications moving forward. The Commission discussed the possibility of removing the historic rating from the structure if the historic significance no longer exists. Troy Wells stated that the additions are very obvious by the breaks in the existing siding, and vinyl siding would improve the appearance. Mrs. Powell stated that the historic significance based on the SHAARD Database is architectural. Mr. Wells stated that in his opinion, this structure does not have any architectural significance to warrant a historic rating. Mr. Renne stated that the Commission reviewed a structure in the past that had been added on to so many times in the past that it no longer warranted a historic rating. Mr. Renne stated that there are two options; one, the historic rating could be removed or two, approve as like for like based on the aluminum existing siding. Jeff Cox detailed the guidelines as they apply to this application. The Commission discussed the process to remove the historic rating and which option would be more beneficial. The Commission requested the applicant file a petition to remove the historic rating from the structure. The Commission requested staff work with applicant to begin the process to remove the historic rating.

Discussion – Amendment to Sign Ordinance in Relation to the Expanded Historic Districts

Jim Renne stated that the issue is a request was made for backlit signs, and the guidelines under which HPC operates prohibits internally illuminated signs. Stacie Krieger asked if the strip mall on Main Street has illuminated signs before, and Mr. Renne stated that Crickets has an existing illuminated sign. Ms. Krieger asked what the location of the requested signs would be, and David Wills responded and stated on the building. The Commission discussed the process of amending ordinances and possible amendments to the historic section of the guide ordinance. The Commission discussed the illumination of the vending machine at Lock and Dam Park. Ms. Krieger stated that she is concerned that if the Commission allows this, it could set a precedent. The Commission discussed existing signs in the historic districts. The Commission continued discussion regarding internal illuminated signs. Troy Wells asked if the business owners or the landlord are requesting the sign, and Christy Powell stated that she believes it is the landlord. The Commission discussed the existing Crickets sign. The Commission discussed the existing sign guidelines and determined that they will not be sending a positive recommendation to Plan Commission for the sign ordinance amendment. Jim Renne moved to request for the HPC guidelines as they relate to signage in historic districts remain the same. Jeff Cox seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

Christy Powell stated that she received information from Tavi Wydicks that Crickets is not requesting a new sign, that it is two of the new tenants that are requesting new wall signs.

Announcements:

The Commission discussed Mr. Braden's property at 419 W. Water Street and his request to the remove the historic rating.

Petitions and Comments from Citizens Present:

None.

Adjourn:

Jeff Cox moved to adjourn the meeting. David Wills seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

Chair

Recorder